



Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol
MERTHYR TUDFUL
MERTHYR TYDFIL
County Borough Council

MINUTES OF MEETING

FULL COUNCIL MEETING

WEDNESDAY, 31ST JANUARY, 2018

PRESENT: Councillor K Gibbs (In the Chair)

Councillors J Amos, H Barrett, A Barry, C J Barry, R Braithwaite, S P Brown, B Carter, D Chaplin, M Colbran, C Davies, L Davies, D Hughes, D Isaac, S Jago, C T Jones, D Jones, H R Jones, G Lewis, L Mytton, K O'Neill, G Richards, D Roberts, T Rogers, D Sammon, T Skinner, W R Smith, J Thomas, G Thomas, I Thomas, S Thomas and C Tovey

Officers:

Gareth Chapman (Chief Executive), Carys Kennedy (Head of Legal and Governance Services - Monitoring Officer), Ellis Cooper (Deputy Chief Executive), Steve Jones (Head of Finance), Judith Jones (Head of Planning and Countryside), Lisa Curtis Jones (Chief Officer (Social Services)), Sue Walker (Chief Education Officer), Cheryllee Evans (Chief Officer (Neighbourhood Services)), Jeremy Ashdown (H R Manager), Ceri Dinham (Communications, Consultation and Engagement Manager), Geraint Morgan (Solicitor), Beth Melhuish (Corporate Communications Officer), Chris Jones (Property Services) and Andrew Mogford (Business Change Manager)

Outside Bodies:

Neil Taylor – WSP/Parsons Brinckerhoff
Jim Allen - Architect

Mair Morgan (Democratic Services Officer)

ITEM NO.	AGENDA MATTER	DECISION
693	Apologies for Absence	Apologies for absence were received from Councillor E C Galsworthy.

694	Declarations of Interest	<p>Councillor L Mytton Declared her Interest in Item Three – 21st Century Schools Programme – Proposed New Build for Ysgol-y-Graig Primary School as she has spoken in relation to the matter at a previous Meeting.</p> <p>Councillor C Tovey Declared his Interest in Item Three – 21st Century Schools Programme – Proposed New Build for Ysgol-y-Graig Primary School as he is a Member of Cefn Coed Rugby Club and has Dispensation to Speak and Vote.</p> <p>Councillor H Barrett Declared his Interest in Item Three – 21st Century Schools Programme – Proposed New Build for Ysgol-y-Graig Primary School as he is a Member of Cefn Coed Rugby Club and has Dispensation to Speak and Vote.</p>
695	21st Century Schools Programme - Proposed New Build for Ysgol-y-Graig Primary School	<p>Councillor L Mytton having Declared her Interest in this item left the Meeting for the consideration of this item.</p> <p>The Chief Executive referred the Members to the ‘21st Century Schools Programme – Proposed New Build for Ysgol-y-Graig Primary School’ report and advised that under Paragraph 1.2 of the report it should read ‘9 November 2011’.</p> <p>The Chief Executive also outlined to the Members what had changed since 2011.</p> <p>Ceri Dinham then outlined in detail to the Members the Consultation Process that had been undertaken and together with the Chief Executive referred to the E-Petition Policy and the E-Petitions that had been received and whilst they did not meet the Policy the E-Petitions received had been taken into consideration.</p> <p>Sue Walker then referred the Members to the report and gave details of why the recommendation as outlined in Paragraph 4.31 of the report had been made in that from an Educational perspective the preferred site was Godre’r Coed Playing Fields due to the ability to deliver a 21st Century provision on one site which was sustainable for the needs of 21 Century learners.</p> <p>Neil Taylor of WSP/ Parsons Brinckerhoff then referred in detail to the Access Options Appraisal as contained within the report and Option B10 as the preferred option.</p> <p>Jim Allen Architect then referred to the Technical Design and Build and gave details of the advantages of the Godre’r Coed site together with the drawbacks.</p> <p>The Chief Executive referred the Members to Paragraph 4.40 of the report and advised that the field was protected by the Fields in Trust.</p> <p>The Chief Executive also referred to Paragraph 1.8 of the report that advised that the Professional Officers advice and recommendation was to build on the Godre’r Coed site</p>

(Option 1) for the reasons as outlined within the report.

Councillor A Barry then referred to the report and recommended Option 2 the former Vaynor and Penderyn School site be approved as the preferred location for the new Ysgol-y-Graig Primary School together with recommendations 2.2, 2.3 and 2.4 as outlined within the report.

Councillor A Barry also requested a Recorded Vote.

This recommendation was then seconded by Councillor K O'Neill.

The following questions were then raised by the Members on the report and were responded to in detail by the Officers:

- Has the Welsh Government been asked if it is prepared to fund on an unsuitable site
- Transport Option appraisal – What would happen if a serious accident occurred on the Vaynor and Penderyn Site
- What is the professional Officers preferred Option
- Godre'r Coed is an open space – Would building on this site fit in with Planning Policy – Would objections cause a delay
- Paragraph 4.30 – Disadvantages – What are the implications for the Council on the size of the site
- What is the ratio of staff to pupils – who would make the Risk Assessment
- Would there be toilet facilities on the playing field site
- Paragraph 4.4.1 – Explanation requested on what are the standards and aspirations for a 21 Century School
- Paragraph 4.4.2 – What Policy will have to be taken into account
- Why was the school being moved and not being built on the current Ysgol-y-Graig site
- How much of the curriculum is PE – How much will be lost if the field is lost – How much time will it take away from the school – Why was data not gathered on this- What could be done to overcome the issue of Parking and PE
- Paragraphs 2.3, 4.4.6, 4.4.8 – Has this been put to the residents –Flooding
- Paragraph 3.1.3 – Are there material changes that affect what can be done
- Fields of Trust – Different amount of land required for both sites
- Consultation – What percentage were in favour of the Vaynor and Penderyn Site – What percentage of residents overall were in favour of the Vaynor and Penderyn Site
- Paragraph 4.40 –Disadvantages – Why was the site considered at the start – Could this be a problem for Planning

- Would consideration be given to turn the Vaynor and Penderyn site into a green space
- What was the outcome of the ballot taken at the Special Governing Body Meeting held 3 July 2017
- Paragraph 4.30 – Disadvantages – Why is this higher than other Safeguarding Priorities
- Paragraph 6.0 Is the EQIA still produced
- Of the Questionnaires returned what was the response rate to the Consultation as a proportion of the Electorate
- Large Community Field -Would the facilities be similar on Vaynor and Penderyn or smaller
- The streets around the Vaynor and Penderyn Site – No space for footpaths and walking to and from school – Can access be made to be reasonably safe
- Option A8 – Where is the drop off point- Can there be assurances that other routes are not used – Will it meet the Welsh Government Guidance
- Will a full size rugby pitch be available on the site if Godre'r Coed is used
- How is the site at Godre'r Coed currently accessed
- More opportunities to walk to the Vaynor and Penderyn Site – How could you walk to the Godre'r Coed site
- What about Cricket – What size field would be left
- In relation to footpaths around the area could an explanation be given of a CPO and where would the money come from for a CPO
- Large element missing from the report – Community Impact Assessment on the fields that are in place

The Mayor then called for a ten minute recess from 7.35 pm to 7.45 pm.

The Mayor then asked the Members if they wished to make any Comments on the proposal and a number of Members responded with their comments.

Councillor C Barry then moved an amendment to the recommendation that had been proposed namely that the new Ysgol-y-Graig school be built on the Godre'r Coed Site (Option 1).

Councillor C Barry also requested a recorded vote.

This amendment was then seconded by Councillor D Roberts.

Further comments were then made by the Members on the amendment.

The Monitoring Officer advised that a Recorded vote had to be supported by five Councillors.

Five Councillors then supported the proposal for a Recorded Vote.

The Monitoring Officer then proceeded to take a Recorded vote on the amendment – That the new Ysgol-y-Graig School be built on the Godre'r Coed Site (Option 1).

Councillor	For the Amendment	Against the Amendment
Julian Amos		X
Howard Barrett		X
Andrew Barry		X
Chris Barry	X	
Rhonda Braithwaite	X	
Paul Brown		X
Brent Carter	X	
David Chaplin	X	
Malcolm Colbran		X
Chris Davies		X
Lee Davies		X
Ernie Galsworthy	Absent	Absent
Kevin Gibbs		X
David Hughes		X
David Isaac	X	
Sherelle Jago		X
Clive Jones	X	
David Jones	X	
Harvey Jones	X	
Gareth Lewis	X	
Lisa Mytton	Absent	Absent
Kevin O'Neill		X
Gareth Richards	X	
Darren Roberts	X	
Tony Rogers		X
Declan Sammon		X
Tanya Skinner		X
Bill Smith	X	
Geraint Thomas		X
Ian Thomas	X	
John Thomas		X
Scott Thomas	X	
Clive Tovey		X
Total:	14	17

The Monitoring Officer advised of the result as follows:

For the Amendment - 14
Against the Amendment - 17

Therefore the Amendment fell.

A Member then recommended that an amendment be made to the original proposal under Paragraph 2.4 in that Councillor J Amos be added to the composition.

Councillor A Barry advised that he accepted this amendment.

Councillor C Barry also advised that he supported this

amendment to Paragraph 2.4.

The Monitoring Officer advised that a Recorded vote had to be supported by five Councillors.

Five Councillors then supported the proposal for a Recorded Vote.

The Monitoring Officer then proceeded to take a Recorded vote on the following Proposals:

- (a) That the Former Vaynor and Penderyn School site be approved as the preferred location for the new Ysgol-y-Graig Primary School (Option 2)
- (b) The approved site be appropriated for Planning purposes and Delegated Authority be provided to the Chief Officer Neighbourhood Services to implement the Appropriation Process
- (c) Should any replacement land be required to address that being lost as a result of the new School proposal and in accordance with the Provisions of the Fields in Trust Deed of Dedication the following site/sites be proposed –Teddingtons Field 9,293m2 and the Black Patch 17,956m2
- (d) Delegated power be granted to the Chief Executive in consultation with the Leader, the Leader of the Opposition and Councillor J Amos to take all and any such steps and actions necessary to progress the new school build

Councillor	For the Motion	Against the Motion
Julian Amos	X	
Howard Barrett	X	
Andrew Barry	X	
Chris Barry		X
Rhonda Braithwaite		X
Paul Brown	X	
Brent Carter		X
David Chaplin		X
Malcolm Colbran	X	
Chris Davies	X	
Lee Davies	X	
Ernie Galsworthy	Absent	Absent
Kevin Gibbs	X	
David Hughes	X	
David Isaac		X
Sherelle Jago	X	
Clive Jones		X
David Jones		X
Harvey Jones		X
Gareth Lewis		X
Lisa Mytton	Absent	Absent
Kevin O'Neill	X	
Gareth Richards		X
Darren Roberts		X
Tony Rogers	X	

		<table border="1"> <tr> <td>Declan Sammon</td> <td>X</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Tanya Skinner</td> <td>X</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Bill Smith</td> <td></td> <td>X</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Geraint Thomas</td> <td>X</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Ian Thomas</td> <td></td> <td>X</td> </tr> <tr> <td>John Thomas</td> <td>X</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Scott Thomas</td> <td></td> <td>X</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Clive Tovey</td> <td>X</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total</td> <td>17</td> <td>14</td> </tr> </table> <p>The Monitoring Officer advised of the result as follows:</p> <p>For the Motion – Recommendations a, b, c, and d – 17</p> <p>Against the Motion – Recommendations a, b, c, and d – 14</p> <p>Therefore the Motion was carried.</p>	Declan Sammon	X		Tanya Skinner	X		Bill Smith		X	Geraint Thomas	X		Ian Thomas		X	John Thomas	X		Scott Thomas		X	Clive Tovey	X		Total	17	14
Declan Sammon	X																												
Tanya Skinner	X																												
Bill Smith		X																											
Geraint Thomas	X																												
Ian Thomas		X																											
John Thomas	X																												
Scott Thomas		X																											
Clive Tovey	X																												
Total	17	14																											
696	To deal with any other urgent business or correspondence	The Mayor advised that there was no business deemed urgent.																											
697	To receive communications from Her/His Worship the Mayor	No Communications were received from His Worship the Mayor.																											